



TOWN OF TIBURON
1505 Tiburon Boulevard
Tiburon, CA 94920

Design Review Board Meeting
May 19, 2016
Agenda Item: **I**

STAFF REPORT

To: Members of the Design Review Board

From: Planning Manager Watrous

Subject: 2225 Vistazo East Street; File No. DR2015145; Consider Adoption of a Resolution Denying a Site Plan and Architectural Review Application for Construction of a New Single-Family Dwelling; Shor Capital, LLC, Owner; Assessor Parcel Number: 059-091-55

Reviewed By: _____

BACKGROUND

Following a public hearing and discussion at its May 5, 2016 regular meeting, the Design Review Board directed to staff to prepare a draft resolution denying a Site Plan and Architectural Review application for construction of a new single-family dwelling on property located at 2225 Vistazo East Street. The resolution was to be considered for adoption at the next regular meeting.

The draft resolution is attached as **Exhibit 1**. Draft minutes of the May 5, 2016 meeting are also included in the Design Review Board packet.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Board adopt the draft resolution denying the subject application.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Draft resolution

Prepared By: Daniel M. Watrous, Planning Manager

RESOLUTION NO. 2016-01

A RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE TOWN OF TIBURON DENYING A SITE PLAN AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPLICATION FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW SINGLE-FAMILY DWELLING AT 2225 VISTAZO EAST STREET

ASSESSOR PARCEL NO. 059-091-55

WHEREAS, the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon does resolve as follows:

Section 1. Findings.

- A. The Town of Tiburon received an application for Site Plan and Architectural Review for the construction of a new single-family dwelling (File #DR2015145) on property located at 2225 Vistazo East Street. The application consists of the following:
1. Application form and supplemental materials received November 17, 2015; and
 2. Site plan, demolition plans, landscape plan and elevations prepared by Couture Architecture, received January 14, 2016, and revised plans dated March 3, 2016 and April 11, 2016.
- B. The Design Review Board held a duly-noticed public hearing on this project on February 18, 2016. At that meeting, several property owners in the vicinity raised concerns about the overall size and visual mass of the proposed house, compatibility with the surrounding neighborhood, and the proposed widening of the private roadway of Vistazo East Street. The Design Review Board shared the concerns about the overall size of the house, concluding that a variance for excess lot coverage was not warranted for a house of this size on such a large lot. The Board also raised objections to a proposed rooftop deck, the amount of glazing on the front of the house and the overall roof height. The Board directed the applicant to revise the house design to address these issues and continued the application to the March 17, 2016 meeting.
- C. The applicant subsequently submitted revised plans for the project. The floor area of the proposed house was reduced by 100 square feet to 5,730 square feet and the garage reduced in size by 144 square feet to 716 square feet. The lot coverage of proposed house was reduced by 535 square feet to cover 6,260 square feet (15.0%) of the site, which was 1 square foot less than the 15.0% maximum lot coverage permitted in the RO-2 zone and eliminated the need for the lot coverage variance. The rooftop deck and putting green were removed. The overall roof height was lowered by one foot. The swimming pool was shortened in depth. The overall floor plans, house layout and windows on the building elevations were not substantially changed.

- D. The Design Review Board held a duly-noticed public hearing on this project on March 17, 2016 to review the revised plans. At that meeting, several neighboring residents again raised concerns about the overall size of the proposed house and its compatibility with the Old Tiburon neighborhood. The consensus of the Board was that not enough had been done to substantially change the design of the house. The Boardmembers felt that 1) the house still had too much glazing; 2) the structure was too tall for a two-story home with a flat roof; 3) the retaining walls were too large; 4) the pool elevation exacerbated the wall issues; and 5) the house did not fit with the surrounding neighborhood, particularly the Old Tiburon neighborhood below the house. The application was continued to the April 21, 2016 meeting. The applicant requested a continuance to the May 5, 2016 meeting after determining that the revised story poles were not correctly installed.
- E. The applicant subsequently submitted further changes to the plans for the project. The floor area of the house was not changed. The lot coverage was reduced by 162 square feet to 6,098 square feet (14.5% of the site) and patio, walkway and pool areas were reduced by 350 square feet. The lower floor ceiling height was reduced to 10 feet, which reduced the overall roof height by one foot. The pool was shortened in both directions and the walls in front were reduced to a maximum height of 8 feet and made a darker color. Glazing was removed from most of the master bathroom on the upper level northeast elevation. The solar panels and the uphill deer fence were moved downhill closer to the house.
- F. The Design Review Board held a duly-noticed public hearing on this project on May 5, 2016 to review the revised plans. At that meeting, the Design Review Board reviewed revised plans for the proposed project in accordance with Section 16-52.020 (H) of the Tiburon Zoning Code (Guiding Principles in the Review of Site Plan and Architectural Review Applications), and the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines and determined that the project plans were inconsistent with these principles and guidelines. The applicant was asked if they would prefer a continuance to further revise the project plans or request that the Board make a decision on the application and indicated a request that a decision be made.
- G. The Design Review Board finds, based upon application materials and analysis presented in the February 18, March 17 and May 5, 2016 Staff Reports, public testimony, as well as visits to the site, that the proposed construction of a new single-family dwelling at this site would be inconsistent with the character of this portion of the Old Tiburon neighborhood and would result in excessive visual mass and glazing when viewed from below the site.
- H. The Design Review Board further finds that that the application is inconsistent with the guiding principle of Tiburon Zoning Ordinance Section 16.52.020 (H [1]), which states:

“Site plan adequacy: Proper relation of a project to its site, including that it promotes orderly development of the community, provides safe and reasonable access, and will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, and general welfare.”

The Design Review Board finds that the subject property is located in a transition area between the smaller R-1 zoned properties of the Old Tiburon neighborhood below the site and the larger RO-2 zoned properties of the Hillhaven neighborhood above the site. The floor area of the proposed house would be larger than almost all of the homes in the vicinity, particularly the dwellings below the site. As a result the size of the house does not promote the orderly development of this portion of the Old Tiburon community or create an appropriate transition between the adjacent neighborhoods.

- I. The Design Review Board further finds that that the application is inconsistent with the guiding principle of Tiburon Zoning Ordinance Section 16.52.020 (H [3]), which states:

“Neighborhood Character: The height, size, and/or bulk of the proposed project bears a reasonable relationship to the character of existing buildings in the vicinity. A good relationship of a building to its surroundings is important. For example in neighborhoods consisting primarily of one-story homes, second story additions shall be discouraged, or permitted with increased setbacks or other design features to minimize the intrusion on the neighborhood.”

The Design Review Board finds that the height, size, and bulk of the proposed project does not bear a reasonable relationship to the character of existing buildings in the vicinity. The visual mass of the proposed house design, spread laterally across the site, with large expanses of retaining walls, excessive glazing on the downhill side, and substantial portions of the structure situated well above the existing grade of the property, are inconsistent with the development pattern of smaller homes in the Old Tiburon neighborhood. The house design would also be inconsistent with the appearance of other large dwellings in the vicinity which have less linear building faces and more differentiation of windows and building materials. The proposed house would therefore not have a good relationship to its surroundings.

- J. The Design Review Board further finds that that the application is inconsistent with the goals and principles of the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines. Goal 1 of the Guidelines encourages projects to “reduce effective visual bulk of a structure and to avoid monumental and excessively large buildings.” Goal 1, Principle 1 encourages projects to “cut [a] building into [the] hillside to reduce effective visual bulk.” The Design Review Board finds that the height, retaining walls and excessive glazing of the proposed house and the failure to cut the building far enough into the hillside would not appropriately reduce the effective visual bulk of the building.

Section 2. Denial.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon does hereby deny the application for Site Plan and Architectural Review for the reasons set forth above.

PASSED AND ADOPTED at a regular meeting of the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon on May 19, 2016, by the following vote:

AYES: BOARDMEMBERS:

NOES: BOARDMEMBERS:

ABSENT: BOARDMEMBERS:

MICHAEL TOLLINI, CHAIR
TIBURON DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

ATTEST:

DANIEL M. WATROUS, SECRETARY